



Resident's Environmental Protection Association  
The Old lamb  
Potter Row  
South Heath  
Bucks  
HP16 9LT  
7 July 2015

Dear Neil,

### **Cost assessment table for REPA options**

Thank you for the new report 'High Speed Rail in the Chilterns Part 4: REPA Proposal for extended Chiltern Tunnel, July 2015, which now includes what we petitioned for a year ago (ie Option C5 to Leather Lane), as well as the Liberty Lane C1 option (and several others).

There are a sufficient number of points of concern that we felt we must write immediately.

Inexplicably the cost of the **C1 option to Liberty Lane** has increased by 10% (now £67.95m) from the costs of the June Report – with no explanation. Understandably this further erodes our confidence in your costs to the point that we simply require a full explanation of the derivation of all the numbers.

Specifically in the July Report:

- **Rail systems costs:** they were £17.8m for Option C1 in your June version. They are now £21.7m. When we met on 26 June, we asked if the £17.8m included tunnel cooling: you said it did as the table notes confirmed in both the June and July tables. We presumed the increase from the original £15m for systems that you previously gave us in 2014 was for cooling. The increase to £21.7m cannot reflect fit-out from both ends as you would then not include the £8.3m of 'Extended Preliminaries', as there would be no delay!
- **Highways saving:** in Option C1 the saving has reduced from £9.55m to £7.18m. No explanation for the difference is offered. If it is to allow for a new highway from A413 to the tunnel portal then that should have been in the June Report, as nothing has changed.
- **The add-ons:** your add-ons of 'indirect costs' and 'ECP/VE' all stay unchanged for C1 even though you confirmed at our 26 June meeting that they were percentages of costs, and so should have altered. Why have they not changed for C1?

We have yet to have time to study the costs you have put against the Leather lane C5 option for which we actually petitioned.

However we can see some obvious issues

- We asked at our 26 June meeting (and you agreed) for a variant of fitting out (but not tunnelling) from both ends – which you say would remove all the scheduling issues. This is included in the conclusions of the July report, but has not been costed in the tables.

- We note from the two reports that to extend for 3.7kms to Liberty Lane takes 4 months longer for fitting out, (despite a pro-rated extension taking much longer) but going 4.1km further to Leather lane takes **only** 3 months longer.
- The decision not to have the Hunts Green sustainable placement area has not been incorporated, despite its obvious implications for schemes (eg C5) that would render it and any alternative method of surplus spoil disposal unnecessary.

We asked in our letter of 30 June, to be given the basis of your cuttings figure so we could understand its derivation – as our model shows very different figures. We have received no reply. Our letter of 6 July raised fundamental issues on the scheduling.

It seems entirely inappropriate that we are expected to rely on your quantifications, when, at minimum, there appear to be serious issues with your quality control.

We therefore need the underlying assumptions on which you calculated the cost tables. We believe the point may have come to ask the Select Committee to request that you provide us with the derivation of the costs - at least option C1 and C5 (on which we petitioned).

Without transparency we cannot have confidence in your assessments and the conclusions that you draw from them.

If HS2 Ltd do not respond to what we believe is a very reasonable request, we will be writing to the Select Committee to request their assistance. We feel that they too will be concerned.

Yours sincerely,

Bev Manton  
Chairman, REPA

Copies

Cheryl Gillan, MP Chesham and Amersham  
Marianne Bowtell, Petition Analyst, Country South  
Neil Caulfield, clerk to the Select Committee  
Chairman of Select Committee (via Neil Caulfield)

Sent by e-mail

[Neil.cowie@hs2.org.uk](mailto:Neil.cowie@hs2.org.uk)

[Marianne.Bowtell@hs2.org.uk](mailto:Marianne.Bowtell@hs2.org.uk)

[cheryl.gillan.mp@parliament.uk](mailto:cheryl.gillan.mp@parliament.uk)

[CAULFIELDN@parliament.uk](mailto:CAULFIELDN@parliament.uk)